

## Design Review Board

---



### *Minutes*

**May 9, 2017  
Council Chambers – Lower Level  
57 East 1<sup>st</sup> Street  
4:30 PM**

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1<sup>st</sup> Street at 4:30 p.m.

**Board Members Present:**

Sean Banda - Chair  
Brian Sandstrom  
Taylor Candland  
Nicole Thompson  
J. Seth Placko  
Randy Carter

**Board Members Absent:**

Tracy Roedel (excused)

**Staff Present:**

John Wesley  
Gordon Sheffield  
Tom Ellsworth  
Angelica Guevara  
Wahid Alam  
Lesley Davis  
Kim Steadman  
Mike Gildenstern

**Others Present:**

Sean Molison  
Peter Swingle  
Jen Corey  
Deep Shrestha  
David Taylor  
Arthur Dock  
Adam Baugh  
Russell Young  
Phillip Gollan  
Cody Bowman  
Jeff Welker  
Michael Hreha  
Phillip Gollon  
Cody Bowman  
Shane Allwood  
Sean Mollison

## **Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes May 9, 2017**

### A. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases:

Chair Banda welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

#### **A.1. DR17-006                      1017 N. Dobson Road (Continued from February 14, 2017)**

<b>LOCATION/ADDRESS:</b>	1017 N. Dobson Road
<b>REQUEST:</b>	This is a review of an indoor/outdoor restaurant
<b>COUNCIL DISTRICT:</b>	1
<b>OWNER:</b>	Kimco
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Union Brickyard
<b>ARCHITECT:</b>	Russell Young
<b>STAFF PLANNER:</b>	Tom Ellsworth

**Discussion:** Staff member Ellsworth gave a brief description of the project, and the applicant Russell Young presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Thompson

- Confirmed that the applicant is proposing painting brick, block, and stucco white
- Confirmed that the patrons won't see the parapets from the inside
- Concerned about the lack of color in the proposal, liked the patches of color provided by the red brick
- Proposed an upgraded lighting package
- Concerned about the color/design at such a large scale
- Suggested that the corners could be lighted, and the applicant agreed
- Felt there was an opportunity to add more material, another texture, possibly a plank
- Suggested more industrial complementary features
- Liked that the building architecture no longer ignores the parking area/ entrance Liked interior canopies, but felt that the exterior architecture needs more

Chair Banda

- Suggested that the canopies be placed above the roof line
- Confirmed with the applicant that the standing seam metal type material will be removed to reduce the amount of material on the building, and confirmed with the applicant that the cornices will be made with natural steel
- Concerned with removing the existing diverse roof line
- Liked the occasional standing seam element
- Confirmed that the interior canopies will be made of a wire mesh
- Proposed exposed CMU block on the north and south sides
- Suggested using stressed materials, or wood form board to add to the architecture
- Wanted to see more diversity in materials

## **Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes May 9, 2017**

- Suggested playing up the industrial look, modern industrial pop-outs, and incorporating more brickwork to achieve that aesthetic

### **Boardmember Sandstrom**

- Felt that white may be a departure from the Riverview aesthetic, suggested that the project may need a comprehensive color study
- Wasn't sure that keeping a small amount of brick would be an effective design component
- Was concerned about the simple color/design at such a large scale
- Proposed a modern look, with a standing seam roof, to create more of an industrial look

### **Boardmember Carter**

- Didn't like the design and didn't feel that the project followed the design guidelines
- Felt that the façade was too flat, and had taken movement out of the building,
- Felt that the design/colors were too boring
- Felt that the black/white plain aesthetic would be okay in a smaller building, but would be too overwhelming at this scale
- Concerned about the lack of brick in the "Brickyard"
- Concerned about long blank white façades
- Liked the variety of existing forms, and was concerned that the building will not be as nice if those forms were to be removed
- Doesn't feel that the proposed straight line parapet complies with design guidelines
- Was appreciative of a suggested industrial look
- Wanted to see more architecture on the building

**The Board requested that the project be back to the Board for review with the changes discussed.**

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.2. DR17-008**

**715 North Country Club Drive**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 715 North Country Club Drive  
**REQUEST:** This is a review of a new multi-residence development  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 1  
**OWNER:** Broth LLC/Jimki LC/ Demaree LC  
**APPLICANT:** Athena Studio  
**ARCHITECT:** Peter Swingle  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Wahid Alam

**(Shared Revised Material Board with Board)**

**Discussion:** Staff member Alam gave a brief description of the modified project to the Board

Chair Banda

- Suggested a “mushroom-type” color instead of using the green color proposed

Boardmember Thompson

- Didn't like the proposed green color

Boardmember Carter

- Confirmed that balcony railings would be painted black
- Didn't like the proposed green color

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.3. DR17-013**

**The 1800 Block of East Baseline Road (north side)  
(Continued from February 14, 2017)**

<b>LOCATION/ADDRESS:</b>	The 1800 Block of East Baseline Road (north side)
<b>REQUEST:</b>	This is a review of a pad building
<b>COUNCIL DISTRICT:</b>	3
<b>OWNER:</b>	David Schneider/ETAL
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Neal Feaser
<b>ARCHITECT:</b>	RKAA Architects
<b>STAFF PLANNER:</b>	Lesley Davis

**Continuance to June 13, 2017**

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.4. DR17-020**

**457 South Higley Road  
(Continued from April 11, 2017)**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 457 South Higley Road  
**REQUEST:** This is a review of mini-storage facility  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 2  
**OWNER:** Lloyd and Gail Glenn Family Trust  
**APPLICANT:** Phillip Gollon  
**ARCHITECT:** Arc Services Architectural Concepts  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Kim Steadman

**Discussion:** Staff member Steadman gave a brief description of the project to the Board pointed out that the building will not be as dark as it was rendered, and the applicant, Phillip Gollon presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Carter

- Confirmed that the Zincalume is going to be used in a vertical application, with honed block on bottom, and because it looks like the same Zincalume on the roof, he was concerned.
- Concerned with the receding ridgeline on the corner, as it may create a ponding effect on the roof
- Suggested adding a tower to screen AC units
- Liked the idea of wrapping the corner, but felt that it was executed peculiarly
- Liked the building

Boardmember Thompson

- Confirmed with the applicant that the standing seam roof is the most gradual slope allowed by warranty and code, and that corrugated metal will be used
- Confirmed that corrugated metal will be used on the vertical palette as well
- Liked the project

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Suggested lighting in the front, night light on the office, adding down lights, with an illuminated sign
- Concerned that the sign will just be solid panels, and suggested backlighting the material
- Proposed strip lighting behind the sign, to create an ambient glow, or washing the sign with continuous downlight, so shadows are created on the corrugation

Chair Banda

- Liked the downlighting idea on the corrugated signage
- Suggested building a freestanding monument sign with folly/whimsy to compliment the building

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.5. DR17-021**

**1705 South Stapley Road  
(Continued from April 11, 2017)**

<b>LOCATION/ADDRESS:</b>	1705 South Stapley Road
<b>REQUEST:</b>	This is a review of a review of a drive-thru restaurant
<b>COUNCIL DISTRICT:</b>	3
<b>OWNER:</b>	Vestar Arizona XV11 LLC/American Multi-Cinema
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Whataburger Real Estate
<b>ARCHITECT:</b>	Matthew Bartholomew
<b>STAFF PLANNER:</b>	Wahid Alam

**Continuance to June 13, 2017**

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.6. DR17-022**

**2665 South Alma School Road  
(Continued from April 11, 2017)**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 2665 South Alma School Road  
**REQUEST:** This a review of a drive-thru restaurant  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 3  
**OWNER:** McDonald's Corporation 002-0162  
**APPLICANT:** Withey Morris  
**ARCHITECT:** Adam Baugh  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Lesley Davis

**Discussion:** Staff member Davis gave a brief description of the project to the Board, and the applicant, Adam Baugh presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Carter

- Proposed that the canopy entry be more prominent
- Liked that the yellow on the "M" arch matched the other yellow band on the building
- Proposed moving an overhang away from the edge, possibly a foot or two, to create more substance
- Liked the building

Boardmember Roedel

- Liked the building

Chair Banda

- Confirmed with the applicant that there will be accent lighting and standard down lighting on the wall
- Confirmed that the yellow trim band will run halfway down the plate window, and under the actual trellis element
- Felt that it looks better than before, but felt that the entrance wasn't well defined
- Proposed bringing out the canopy and accented it with downlighting
- Proposed having two bands of light by entry
- Appreciated the significant changes made



**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.7. DR17-023                      1343 South Gilbert Road**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 1343 South Gilbert Road  
**REQUEST:** This is a review of a drive-thru restaurant  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 3  
**OWNER:** K & KT Corporation  
**APPLICANT:** IDStudio4  
**ARCHITECT:** Cody Bowman  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Wahid Alam

**(Shared Revised Material Board with Board)**

**Discussion:** Staff member Alam gave a brief description of the modified project to the Board.

Boardmember Carter

- Confirmed that a brick veneer is being proposed
- Requested that Popeye's change the prototype for the next proposal that they bring to the City of Mesa, as this was the third project in this design style

Chair Banda

- Confirmed that there will be green awnings, liked the project

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Mentioned that he saw a more contemporary Popeye's in Seoul, so a more up to date building design is possible

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.8. DR17-024**

**1126 North Ellsworth Road**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 1126 North Ellsworth Road  
**REQUEST:** This is a review of a mini-storage facility  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 5  
**OWNER:** MagicGifts LLC/ETAL  
**APPLICANT:** Adam Baugh  
**ARCHITECT:** Withey Morris  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Wahid Alam

**Discussion:** Staff member Alam gave a brief overview of the project. Applicant, Adam Baugh presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Carter

- Proposed incorporating desert hues
- Didn't like that the wall color and roll up doors were so close in hue, as it created a static look
- Proposed integrating into a relationship with surrounding architecture
- Encourage to break up the mass of the building
- Proposed using DC Ranch Marketplace as inspiration, and to not try to match the CVS Drug Store on the corner

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Confirmed that the applicant had worked with the concerned neighbor behind the site, and that the project was going to use saguaros instead of trees in that general vicinity

Boardmember Thompson

- Didn't like the large size of the parapet, as it looked dated

Chair Banda

- Suggested that the applicant look to the approved Starbuck's on the southeast corner of Gilbert and McKellips Roads as inspiration for "Modern Desert Architecture", as that project employed honed CMU, COR-TEN steel for the rust color, galvalume, and different textures
- Encouraged the applicant to use the recently approved Sprouts Grocery Store at 3150 N. Recker Road for inspiration
- Encouraged the applicant to use DC Ranch Marketplace as inspiration, and cited the pressed form concrete, honed CMU, various corrugated metals, and standing seam roofs

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes**  
**May 9, 2017**

Boardmember Placko

- Was concerned about the screen walls, confirming that a standard 3' stand up block wall will be used, and encouraged better integration between wall, building, and landscape
- Confirmed that underground retention will be used near the backside wall
- Felt that the palette fits the area, however he didn't like the ¼ minus ground plane surfacing choice, as it doesn't match the surrounding area, and creates erosion issues. Suggested using a 2' minus blend of large and small rocks
- Liked how plants at the site are being salvaged

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.9. DR17-025**

**8300 block of East Pecos Road**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 8300 block of East Pecos Road  
**REQUEST:** This is a review of a large manufacturer  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 6  
**OWNER:** Chancellor Holdings, LLC  
**APPLICANT:** Welker Development Resources, LLC.,  
**ARCHITECT:** Jeff Welker  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Kim Steadman

**Discussion:** Staff member Steadman gave a brief overview of the project. Applicant Jeff Welker presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Thompson

- Proposed a lighting and metal element over the overhead doors
- Liked the project

Chair Banda

- Confirmed with applicant that the proposed user of the building manufactures curtain walls, glazing, metal systems, etc., and appreciated how those elements were integrated into the design
- Liked the design of the building

Boardmember Carter

- Felt that it was a nice project and a nice addition to the area

Boardmember Placko

- Concerned that a lot of the landscaping palette consists of flowering shrub material, and this would set up the client for a maintenance problem with over-trimming
- Proposed working in more accents, particularly succulents (Hesperaloe, desoerilian, agaves) so they are not easily over-trimmed
- Felt that the proposed ¼ minus gravel will erode quickly, proposed a different larger granite, at least in the retention basin.
- Proposed enhancing the planting style with more clustering, layering, texturing. Suggested reworking the warehouse side, as currently it is showing only 8 shrubs on islands, and an enhanced landscape program against the screen wall

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.10. DR17-026                      1440 South Higley Road**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 1440 South Higley Road  
**REQUEST:** This is a review of a coffee shop  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 2  
**OWNER:** Lowes H I W Inc.,  
**APPLICANT:** Larson Engineering  
**ARCHITECT:** Michael Hreha  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Wahid Alam

**Discussion:** Staff member Alam gave a brief overview of the project, and mentioned that the elevations that the Board is seeing are architectural drawings. Applicant Michael Hreha presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Thompson

- Didn't like the added-on light
- Didn't like the canopy, proposed covering the entire drive way, with a cantilevered approach, and maybe cutting back to half the size or providing a shade canopy over the seating area at the front entry
- Reaffirmed that a stamped Architect would need to do the drawings
- Reminded the applicant to show the mechanical equipment as a dashed line to clarify that it is fully screened by the parapet

Chair Banda

- Proposed breaking up the architecture better
- Felt that it looked too pre-fab, resembled a conex box
- Although the façade is covered in signage, he felt that it provided a unique look
- Felt that the drive-thru canopy looks tacked on
- Cited the overhang made of perf material at the proposed Starbucks at Gilbert and McKellips Roads, and didn't like the two metal posts supporting the canopy on this project
- Didn't like the wall pack unit lighting proposed
- Suggested employing a unique lighting program
- Suggested that bike racks should be more customized
- Felt that there was too much sheen coming off the wood composite material
- Liked the design

Boardmember Carter

- Didn't like the canopy, proposed covering the entire drive way, with a cantilevered approach, and maybe cutting back to half the size
- Worried about solar gain on the south and west sides, and proposed pulling the canopy around the south and west sides, and not as much on the north
- Was concerned about the mismatched height of the windows on the south elevation, and proposed making them all the same height.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes**  
**May 9, 2017**

- Proposed using ceramic tile planks that look like wood instead of the composite proposed

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Proposed using reveals and window heads, to put a finesse in the detailing
- Proposed using a beam element and wrapping it down the building
- Suggested running a vertical structure with gapping on it
- Stated that the building needed an architectural overhang, at least on one side
- Confirmed that the mechanical units are screened by the tower
- Had concern approving drawings in this form

Boardmember Placko

- Liked the way the trees and palms mesh with the context of the Lowes parking lot
- Suggested having the architect draw screen sages to real world proportion, as they are currently shown undersized, setting up a maintenance issue

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.11. DR17-027                      6502 East Brown Road**

<b>LOCATION/ADDRESS:</b>	6502 East Brown Road
<b>REQUEST:</b>	This is a review of a senior living community
<b>COUNCIL DISTRICT:</b>	5
<b>OWNER:</b>	Brown Road Baptist Church
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Ryan Companies
<b>ARCHITECT:</b>	Tyler Wilson
<b>STAFF PLANNER:</b>	Wahid Alam

**Discussion:** Staff member Alam gave a brief overview of the project. Applicant, Shane Allwood, Tiffany & Bosco, presented the project to the Board.

Arthur Dock, at 1302 N. 66<sup>th</sup> Street, would like to see an architectural style, and not a “Technicolor yawn” of mish-mashed colors. He continued by saying that there is a wide variety of architecture to pull from in the neighborhood, but can be done well. He closed by suggesting little adjustments to the building to break up the massing, and stressed the importance of landscaping along the perimeter of the parking lot

Boardmember Thompson

- Questioned the air conditioning units under the windows, didn’t like the louvres, felt punched in, and suggested better placement
- Cited the new assisted living home example on McDowell and Power, near Las Sendas

Boardmember Carter

- Would like to see something like the assisted living home on the southeast corner of Brown and Val Vista, Lindsay and Guadalupe, Recker Road south of Main Street, and McDowell and Val Vista
- Felt that it was a massive building, and the detailing lacks interest
- Felt that the building should bring about more of a sense of community, and proposed a more comfortable type of architecture, more of a sensitive hand looking at massing and color
- Felt that the venting for the A/C units could be changed
- Proposed sills, headers, and shutters on windows
- Felt that the building needs to echo some of the older design motifs associated with an target older age group
- Felt that the roof was too flat, and that it needs to be more sensitive to the area

## **Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes May 9, 2017**

### **Chair Banda**

- Suggested adding details to give it more of a “home” finish
- Wanted to see more color and materiality
- Proposed that the applicant draw inspiration from the façade and entry canopy of a Staybridge Suites Hotel in Lexington, KY, as shown in the Work Session
- Liked the roof planes, but proposed playing with material, to make the entrance more grand
- Felt that three stories of mediocre pillars holding balconies won’t read well as it ages
- Proposed using low key down lighting, and unique signage

### **Boardmember Sandstrom**

- Concerned that a “Tuscan” approach in the design may not be appropriate next to a neighborhood that doesn’t feature “Tuscan” architecture
- Would like to see the building integrate landscaping on to it, utilizing planters off windows, planters on stairs, and trellises to soften the architecture of a 3-story building next to a 1 story neighborhood
- Wanted to see more color and materiality
- Confirmed that the building will feature a HVAC detached system, and that he would like to see more thought where the venting units are located

### **Boardmember Placko**

- Was concerned about the placement of thorny Palo Brea trees on the north side, as they appear close to the sidewalk
- Cautioned the applicant to maintain sight visibility triangles at ingress/egress points



**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

**A.12. DR17-028**

**3300 Block of South 96th Street**

**LOCATION/ADDRESS:** 3300 Block of South 96th Street  
**REQUEST:** This is a review of a large manufacturer  
**COUNCIL DISTRICT:** 6  
**OWNER:** Sunbelt Land Holdings LP  
**APPLICANT:** Butler Design Group  
**ARCHITECT:** Sean Molison/ Clay Chiapinni  
**STAFF PLANNER:** Lesley Davis and Tom Ellsworth

**Discussion:** Staff member Ellsworth gave a brief overview of the project. Applicant, Clay Chiappini, presented the project to the Board.

Boardmember Thompson

- Felt that the architecture was too repetitive, suggested the darker gray elements combine into one mass, change window types, and add more massing in the middle
- Suggested the recessed pockets painted to mimic the silos on the west elevation

Boardmember Carter

- Didn't see much of a change from the first exhibit shown last month
- Concerned that the public park is just to the south of the site, and that everyone will be seeing 500' of the plain south elevation
- Liked the plane changes on the recently approved tilt-up Longbow Project
- Encouraged the applicant to play with massing, texture, paint, lighting
- Would like to see some marriage between the north and south elevation, but should put emphasis on enhancing the southern element
- Suggested adding blue to the corners like the blue seen on the west side to break up monotony of façade

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Felt that there wasn't much of a change from the first exhibit shown last month, regardless of the window size/frequency/number change
- Suggested creating some relief in the panels, and changing the rhythm with chamfer strips. Encouraged dimensional relief, and was concerned that the building is all on the same plane, a roughly 1000' plane, and felt that was too long to only consist of a flat façade
- Suggested breaking up the façade like the recently approved tilt-up project at Longbow
- Concerned building will set precedent of future buildings in the area

Chair Banda

- Asked for plane changes, like those seen on the corners of the Contempo and Longbow tilt-up projects

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes  
May 9, 2017**

- Would like to see plane changes in corners, additional massing in center, and an increased lighting role.
- Suggested possibly using a pressed form, rough pour textures, and form lines

**B. Call to Order**

Chair Banda called the meeting to order at 6:54 pm

**C. Receive and Discuss Sign Code Updates from Zoning Administrator**

Zoning Administrator Sheffield delivered a presentation on the Zoning Code Update

**D. Consider the Minutes from the April 11, 2017 meeting**

On a motion by Boardmember Carter and seconded by Boardmember Thompson, the Board unanimously approved the April 11, 2017 minutes.

(Vote: 6-0)

**E. Discuss and take action on the following Design Review cases:**

**F. Adjournment**

On a motion by Boardmember Sandstrom and seconded by Boardmember Thompson, the meeting adjourned at 7:44 pm.

(Vote: 6-0)

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644-3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644-2767.**

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes**  
**May 9, 2017**